

# Backgrounder: 2018 Teddy Waste Awards

## Federal Nominees

### The Department of Canadian Heritage (Winner)

*Nominated for: Canada 150 Parliament Hill Rink*

**Cost: \$8.2 million**

As part of the celebrations commemorating Canada's 150<sup>th</sup> birthday, the Department of Canadian Heritage built a temporary outdoor skating rink on Parliament Hill.

The original plan called for the rink to only be open for three weeks in December 2017. After it was pointed out that it seemed bizarre to close an outdoor skating rink in Ottawa on January 1, the government decided to keep it open until the end of February.

Rules for the rink included: no food or drink, no cellphones (rule later dropped), no hockey sticks, no babies in carriers and no "rough play." Short, 45-minute skating time slots were released 48 hours in advance and reservations had to be made online.

The surprisingly high cost for the rink was attributed to security, insurance and attached facilities like changerooms and bleachers, as well as the cost of transporting peewee hockey teams to Ottawa (extreme cold weather ultimately forced the players to move to an indoor rink.) Based on projections as of late January using the number of people who have skated on the rink so far, the cost of the rink will run approximately \$100,000 per day and \$53 per skater.

Notably, the rink is located just one block away from the Rideau Canal, which is widely known as Canada's most famous outdoor skating rink.

#### Sources:

- CTV [Keeping Canada 150 rink open will cost taxpayers an additional \\$2.5M](#) January 25, 2018
- [Official Rink Site](#)
- Global [Skating rink on Parliament Hill set to cost \\$5.6M, passes must be reserved online](#) November 22, 2017
- National Post [The latest wrinkle in the \\$4.3-million Canada 150 Rink — it's too cold to play hockey there](#) December 28, 2017
- CBC [Bell Capital Cup called a success, even with Parliament Hill freeze-out](#) December 29, 2017
- Maclean's [Canadian Heritage would like to clarify some things about the Parliament Hill rink](#) November 30, 2017
- CTV [Selfies allowed on Parliament Hill Rink after all](#) November 29, 2017
- Toronto Star [Canada 150 rink to stay for February — but hockey still a no-no](#) November 23, 2017

## The Department of Finance (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Most Expensive Budget Cover Art*

**Cost: At least \$192,000**

Documents obtained under the *Access to Information Act* revealed that the Department of Finance spent at least \$192,000 on graphics and advertising related to the 2017 budget, including \$89,500 on talent fees for photos and models, and \$24,990 for a photo shoot for four images on the hard-copy budget cover.

Emails between various Finance officials also documented the extensive back-and-forth over such details as the colour scheme, the ethnicities of the models and whether or not one model should wear glasses.

The 2017 budget projected a deficit of \$28.5 billion.

### Sources:

- Blacklock's [Budget Cover Cost \\$212,234](#) October 12, 2017
- National Post [Andrew Coyne: Bloated, glossy \\$212,000 federal budget cover a fitting symbol of modern government](#) October 24, 2017
- National Post [Colby Cosh: \\$200,000 on a budget cover? That's exclusively Liberal tomfoolery](#) October 13, 2017
- The Star [Inside the government's \\$157,000 budget artwork](#) October 20, 2017
- Paul Wells [Finance department responds on budget cover](#) October 16, 2017

## Public Services and Procurement Canada (Nominee)

*Nominated for: The Phoenix Payroll Boondoggle*

### Cost: Closing in on \$1 billion

In 2009, the federal government began the process of consolidating the payroll system for government employees, at an anticipated cost of \$310 million. The new centralized Phoenix payroll system was expected to save taxpayers \$70 million a year beginning in the 2016–17.

The government launched the Phoenix payroll system in two phases, in February and April 2016, but problems began to surface immediately, with reports of employees being underpaid, overpaid or not paid at all, and the number of problems has exploded since. As of December 2017, at least \$400 million has been spent fixing the system with hundreds of thousands of cases outstanding. The Auditor General concluded in late 2017 that the total bill to fix the Phoenix payroll would be close to \$1 billion.

### Sources:

- Hill Times [Phoenix backlog up by 70,000 cases, but 54,000 collective agreement cases are priority](#) December 15, 2017
- Globe and Mail [Feds have no alternative to Phoenix pay system: Lemay](#) November 28, 2017
- The Globe and Mail [Politics Briefing: Where does the money to fix Phoenix go?](#) November, 24 2017
- CP [Phoenix by the numbers](#) November 21, 2017
- Auditor General of Canada [2017 Fall Reports - Report 1—Phoenix Pay Problems](#) November 21, 2017
- MacLean's [Fixing Phoenix pay system will cost over \\$540 million, says auditor](#) November 21, 2017
- Global [Phoenix-related pay errors affected more than half of all federal public servants: auditor general](#) November 21, 2017
- Hill Times [‘Common-sense’ demands: unions want Tax Act exemption, more staff to deal with Phoenix](#) January 10, 2018
- Ottawa Citizen [The other side of Phoenix: Public servants who were overpaid are also hurting](#) December 27, 2017
- Global [Edmonton woman told she owes \\$43K as result of Phoenix pay system errors](#) December 3, 2017

## The Trudeau Government (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Most Offensive Settlement of a Lawsuit*

**Cost: \$10.5 million**

In July 2017, news broke that the Trudeau government had agreed to pay \$10.5 million to settle a lawsuit launched by former Guantanamo Bay detainee Omar Khadr. Mr. Khadr had been seeking compensation for his time spent at Guantanamo, arguing that the Canadian government was complicit in his detention.

The Trudeau government implied that it had “no choice” but to settle the matter, based on a Supreme Court of Canada finding that Mr. Khadr’s Charter rights had been violated, in spite of that fact this ruling did not speak to compensation, which could potentially have been far less than \$10.5 million.

A survey from the Angus Reid institute found that 71% of Canadians believed the Trudeau government should have fought the case and left a court to determine if he was owed compensation, and 65% of Canadians rejected the argument that the Trudeau government had “no choice” but to settle.

The CTF launched a petition opposing the payment and secured over 133,000 signatures in just nine days.

### Sources:

- CTF [CANADIAN TAXPAYERS FEDERATION DELIVERS PETITION OPPOSING \\$10.5 MILLION PAYOUT TO OMAR KHADR](#) July 13, 2017
- CTF [CANADIAN TAXPAYERS FEDERATION SLAMS PROPOSED \\$10 MILLION PAYOUT TO OMAR KHADR](#) July 4, 2017
- CTV [PM sidesteps comment on Khadr settlement rumour](#) July 4, 2017
- Angus Reid [Khadr’s Compensation: 71% of Canadians say government made wrong call by settling out of court](#) July 2017
- Global [Government issues official apology, confirms settlement payout to Omar Khadr](#) July 7, 2017
- CBC [Prime Minister Trudeau heckled about Omar Khadr at Hamilton town hall](#) January 10, 2018
- Global [Justin Trudeau says \\$10.5 million payout to Omar Khadr was ‘best option’](#) July 13, 2017

## Health Canada (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Most Expensive Twitter Account*

### **Cost: More than \$100,000**

Access to information documents obtained by the CBC showed that the Twitter account for the federal Minister of Health cost taxpayers more than \$100,000 year to operate.

The account, which tweeted on average less than twice per day, required the equivalent of 1.5 full time government employees to run, with after-hours and weekend work racking up \$6,500 in overtime costs.

The documents showed that planning for tweets occurs weeks in advance and undergo an extensive vetting and approval process. The Twitter account only has 3,200 followers.

### **Sources:**

- CBC <http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/twitter-health-minister-philpott-petitpas-taylor-account-tweets-1.4493130> January 19, 2018
- Postmedia [EDITORIAL: Ministers don't need paid social media staffers](#) January 22, 2018
- Canadian press [Government tweets sanitized through 'super-rigid process'](#) February 2, 2014
- ATIP: <http://www.taxpayer.com/media/HealthMin-Twitter.pdf>

## Provincial Nominees

### Ontario's Fair Hydro Plan (Winner)

*Nominated for: Worst Cost Savings Plan Ever*

**Cost: \$21 billion to \$39 billion (projected)**

The Wynne government, facing increasing public anger about rising hydro costs, came up with a plan to reduce bills, which will cost ratepayers tens of billions of dollars. A report by the Financial Accountability Office from May 2017 notes that the plan, which involves Ontario Power Generation (OPG) borrowing money to keep hydro rates relatively flat until 2021, will then see rates increase by 6.8% every year until 2027 in order to pay back the borrowed money with interest.

Ontario's Auditor General issued a scathing report in October 2017, calling the plan "needlessly complex" and concluding that over the next 30 years, the Fair Hydro Plan would ultimately end up costing taxpayers an additional \$39 billion (\$18 billion in borrowed funds, plus \$21 billion in interest costs)

#### Sources:

- Globe and Mail [Ontarians can expect higher hydro bills to repay short-term relief: FAO](#) May 24, 2017
- Ontario Government [Ontario's Fair Hydro Plan](#)
- CBC [Auditor general blasts Kathleen Wynne's 'Fair Hydro Plan](#) October 17, 2017
- Auditor General of Ontario [The Fair Hydro Plan: Concerns About Fiscal Transparency, Accountability and Value For Money](#) October 2017
- Financial Accountability Office of Ontario [An Assessment of the Fiscal Impact of the Province's Fair Hydro Plan](#) Spring 2017
- Office of the Premier [Premier's Statement on Ontario's Fair Hydro Plan](#) March 2, 2017
- Global [Customers could pay steep price for Ontario's hydro plan, auditor warns](#) October 17, 2017

## Government of Ontario (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Most Expensive Counterfeit Rubber Duck*

**Cost: \$200,000**

The Ontario government paid \$200,000 to have a giant rubber duck tour the province as part of the Canada/Ontario 150 celebrations. The rubber duck – which has no connection to Canada or Ontario – stands 61 feet tall and weighs 30,000 pounds. It was built by an American company which charges approximately \$40,000 per appearance (plus the cost of towing).

Several days after news of the duck broke, a Dutch design studio claimed that the rented duck was an “illegal counterfeit” which copied their concept and called the cost “exorbitant,” noting that they would have made the original available had the government inquired.

### Sources

- CBC [Giant rubber duck for Canada 150 a waste of taxpayer money: Ontario PCs](#) May 29, 2017
- Wall Street Journal [Happy 150th Birthday, Canada! What's With the Giant, Inflatable Duck?](#) June 30, 2017
- The Globe and Mail [Giant rubber duck for Canada 150 a waste of taxpayer money: Ontario PCs](#) May 29, 2017
- CBC [What the duck? Ontario paid \\$121K to festival bringing world's largest rubber duckie to Canada](#) May 29, 2017
- Lfpress.com [Ontario to kick off 150th birthday celebration with giant inflatable duck costing \\$200Gs](#) May 29, 2017
- Global <https://globalnews.ca/news/3495290/canada-150-giant-duck-illegal-counterfeit/> June 1, 2017

## Government of New Brunswick (Nominee)

*Nominated for: The Atcon Con*

**Cost: \$63.4 million**

Beginning in 1993, the Government of New Brunswick provided taxpayer loans and grants to Atcon, a Miramichi-based construction company. In 2010, the company collapsed while still owing the provincial government more than \$63 million.

An investigation by New Brunswick's Auditor General in 2015 revealed that cabinet had ignored the advice of senior civil servants not to make a \$50 million loan guarantee in 2009, and that cabinet also later removed terms and conditions put in place to minimize risk to taxpayers.

In 2017 the Auditor General completed a follow-up audit examining Atcon's books in greater detail and discovered that Atcon had been paying individuals who didn't actually work for the company, and that several employees had submitted non-work related expenses through the company. Worst of all, the Auditor General found that at the time of the 2009 loan guarantees, Atcon's financial situation was so bad that the loans were "never going to have been enough to 'save' Atcon" in the first place.

In conclusion, the Auditor General found the government's behaviour showed "a very troubling disregard for taxpayers' money."

### Sources:

- Auditor General of New Brunswick [This volume presents our special examination which details findings and work performed to address remaining unanswered questions from the 2015 Report "Financial Assistance to Atcon Holdings Inc. and Industry."](#) October 2017
- Auditor General of New Brunswick [Performance report on Financial Assistance to Atcon Holdings Inc. and Industry](#) March 2015
- Huffington Post [http://www.huffingtonpost.ca/2015/03/24/key-findings-from-new-bru\\_n\\_6933066.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.ca/2015/03/24/key-findings-from-new-bru_n_6933066.html) March 24, 2015
- National Post [Failing firm spent big on luxuries as it sought government funding: N.B. auditor](#) October 3, 2017
- CBC [Atcon was so badly managed, taxpayers' \\$63M was never going to save it, AG finds](#) October 3, 2017
- CBC [Atcon's 'extravagance' while asking for taxpayer help surprised auditor general](#) October 4, 2017
- Government of New Brunswick [Auditor general answers "where did the money go?" in new Atcon report](#) October 3, 2017
- CBC [Opposition calls for accountability for those involved in Atcon loan fiasco](#) October 6, 2017



## Danny Graham, CEO of Engage Nova Scotia (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Most Disengaged Engagement Officer*

**Cost: \$163,008 per year**

Created by the Nova Scotia government in 2012, Engage Nova Scotia is a non-profit entity which aspires to “shine a light on our opportunities, advantages and hurdles in front of us.”

In 2014, Premier Stephen McNeil appointed Danny Graham – who just happens to be one of McNeil’s predecessors as leader of the Nova Scotia Liberals – as Engage’s “Chief Engagement Officer” at a monthly salary of \$13,500 (or \$163,000 per year). In total, 78% of Engage’s budget comes courtesy of taxpayer subsidies.

In spite of this generous salary, Graham has difficulty describing what Engage does and acknowledges it is difficult to quantify. In March 2017, the CTF called for the Nova Scotia government to stop subsidizing Engage Nova Scotia, citing no evidence that it provides value for taxpayers.

### Sources:

- Global News [Canadian Taxpayers Federation questions value of Engage Nova Scotia](#) March 17, 2017
- The Chronicle Herald [Amended agreement allowed Engage Nova Scotia to double-bill taxpayers: CTF](#) June 7, 2016
- Canadian Taxpayers Federation [NS: FORMER NS LIBERAL LEADER GETS BIG PAY DAY THANKS TO CONTRACT FROM MCNEIL GOVERNMENT](#) March 16, 2017
- Canadian Taxpayers Federation [GOVERNMENT AMENDS CONTRACT TO AID GROUP HEADED BY FORMER LIBERAL LEADER](#) June 7, 2016
- CTV News Atlantic [Taxpayers Federation calls on N.S. government to cut funding to non-profit organization](#) March 15, 2017
- CTV News Atlantic [N.S. Opposition joins calls for Liberal government to stop funding Engage NS](#) March 16, 2017
- CBC [Tories call on McNeil to end former leader's 'plum patronage job'](#) March 16, 2017

## SaskPower (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Fishiest Office Decor*

**Cost: \$20,000 per year**

For decades, SaskPower, the province's electric utility, kept a fish pond in the lobby of its Regina headquarters at a maintenance cost of \$20,000 per year to Saskatchewan taxpayers.

The costs were ultimately revealed by a freedom of information request made by the CTF, which showed that in 2016, the fish pond had finally been removed at a cost of \$15,000.

And in a happy ending, a good Samaritan adopted the fish.

### Sources:

- CTF FOI <http://www.taxpayer.com/media/Fishpond.pdf>
- [No trip to @saskpower is complete without saying hi to the fish: #yqr @shootersean](#)
- CBC [No extravagant renos at SaskPower HQ, government vows](#) September 18, 2014

# Municipal Nominees

## City of Montreal (Winner)

*Nominated for: Formula E (gregious Waste Of Taxpayers' Money)*

### Cost: \$34 Million

The City of Montreal spent tens of millions trying to attract the Formula-E, F1's electric-powered cousin. Despite already having a world-class racetrack, the city created a downtown circuit and bought new safety fences and equipment. Organizers even paid for road repairs, in spite of the fact no other host city had spent a cent to host the event. The 2017 event was a flop, selling only 25,000 out of 45,000 tickets and featuring mostly empty bleachers.

In December 2017, new Montreal Mayor Valerie Plante cancelled the 2018 race mere weeks after being elected, suggesting that \$7.5 million worth of concrete barriers which had been purchased for the now-cancelled event could be used as temporary dikes during future seasonal flooding.

The final bill to taxpayers for the 2017 Formula E was approximately \$34 million.

### Sources:

- CBC [Montreal to foot \\$24M bill for Formula E race, but other cities pay nothing to host same event](#) June 15, 2017
- CBC [Formula E: Making Montreal great again or the mayor's Waterloo?](#) July 29, 2017
- Montreal Gazette [Montreal pulls the plug on troubled Formula E event](#) December 18, 2017
- Montreal Gazette [From Formula E to flood breaks: Plante mulls recycling pricey concrete barriers](#) January 17, 2018
- InsideEVs [Formula E Montreal Race Cancelled](#) January 9 2018
- CBC [Montreal to foot \\$24M bill for Formula E race, but other cities pay nothing to host same event](#) June 15 2017
- Montreal Gazette [Denis Coderre defends Montreal's Formula E race over ticket revelation](#) November 1 2017
- CBC [The organizer of Montreal's Formula E race is millions of dollars in debt](#) December 14 2017
- CBC ['Mission accomplished': Denis Coderre says race was success, despite complaints](#) July 31 2017:
- CBC ['No economic argument' for spending \\$7.5M on Formula E concrete barriers, says city councillor](#) July 19 2017

## United Firefighters of Winnipeg (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Most Outrageous Taxpayer-Funded Union President*

### **Cost: At least \$1.4 million**

For several decades, Winnipeg taxpayers were paying the full salary of the Winnipeg firefighters' union president even though he was on leave from firefighting duties. In 2014, under a new collective agreement, that figure dropped to 40% of the UFFW presidents' salary, or about \$70,000 annually. No other unions representing city employees receive a taxpayer subsidy for the salary of their president.

Mayor Brian Bowman says the city wants the taxpayer subsidy to be revisited as part of the next round of collective bargaining expected in 2020.

Current UFFW President Alex Forrest has taken at least 60 out-of-town trips for various union and firefighter-related events over the last three and a half years, none of which have involved fighting fires.

### **Sources:**

- CBC ['Do the right thing' and pay Winnipeggers back: Canadian Taxpayers Federation to firefighters union](#) Jan 8 2018
- CBC [Taxpayers on hook for 60% of Winnipeg firefighters union president's salary and benefits, agreement shows](#) Jan 5, 2018
- CBC ['Do the right thing' and pay Winnipeggers back: Canadian Taxpayers Federation to firefighters union](#) Jan 8, 2018:
- CBC [Winnipeg mayor wants firefighter union president's pay agreement scrapped as soon as possible](#) Jan 17 2018
- CTV [Mayor unhappy tax dollars going to fire fighter union boss's salary](#) Jan 9, 2018
- Winnipeg Free Press [Firefighters' union criticizes media for 'attack' on Forrest](#) Jan 23, 2018
- Winnipeg Free Press [Union should mull over Forrest's future](#) Jan 20, 2018
- Winnipeg Free Press [60 trips for high-flying union boss](#) Jan 19 2018
- CBC [Former Winnipeg fire chief tried to end union president's pay agreement months before he was fired](#) January 17, 2018
- Winnipeg Free Press ['It should have been flagged': mayor](#) Jan 17, 2018

## Toronto Transit Commission (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Risky Digital Art*

**Cost: \$1.9 million**

In 2009, the Toronto Transit Commission (TTC) commissioned public art for the six new subway stations being built on the Yonge-University Line. The art, titled *LightSpell* would allow TTC customers to type messages up to eight characters in length, which would then be displayed in lighting throughout the station.

But when the new stations opened in December 2017, *LightSpell* remained offline, as the TTC was concerned about “hate speech and the potential for the installation to be misused by some.” Proposed remedies have included a potential “whitelist” of acceptable terms, or a filter to block out certain terms, although the latter could backfire if it was interpreted by customers as a challenge to find ways around the filter.

### Sources:

- Jan 18 2018: <https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2018/01/18/ttc-still-at-impasse-over-dormant-19-million-art-installation.html>
- CBC Radio [\\$500K Toronto subway digital art installation kept offline over hate speech fears](#) Dec 27 2017:
- National Post ['Sounds more like North Korea': Anti-censorship Toronto subway art delayed over hate speech fears](#) Jan 3 2018:
- Globe and Mail [TTC won't use subway word-art installation over fear of hate speech](#) Dec 25, 2017
- The Star [TTC still at impasse over dormant \\$1.9-million art installation](#) Jan 18, 2018

## City of Montreal (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Most Expensive Traffic Control*

### **Cost: \$15 million in the last 18 months**

The City of Montreal spent millions on overtime pay for police officers to direct traffic at city construction sites at rates of up to \$125 per hour. This was in spite of the police force previously complaining about having too few resources. Some cities, such as Vancouver, have switched similar duties over to civilians who are paid between \$22 and \$26 per hour.

In August 2017, the City of Montreal and Montreal police entered into a new collective agreement that would see 75 per cent of traffic control duties entrusted to (much lower paid) cadets, helping to reduce costs for taxpayers.

### **Sources:**

- CTV [Traffic cops paid \\$15 million in overtime over past 18 months](#) Aug 9, 2017
- CBC [Montreal police approve new collective agreement](#) Aug 10, 2017
- CBC [Montreal expects to pay police at least \\$12M to direct traffic this year](#) Oct 20, 2016
- CBC [Should Montreal police officers be on traffic duty? It's costly](#) May 31, 2017
- CTV [Traffic cops paid \\$15 million in overtime over past 18 months](#) Aug 9, 2017
- CBC [Montreal police approve new collective agreement](#) Aug 10, 2017
- Montreal Gazette [Use civilian employees, not pricey police officers, to direct traffic: Projet Montréal](#) May 31, 2016

## City of Toronto (Nominee)

*Nominated for: Stairway to Bureaucracy*

**Cost: \$10,000 (thankfully, not \$150,000)**

Adi Astl asked city officials about the cost of getting stairs installed on a steep slope in Tom Riley Park in Etobicoke where several of his neighbours had fallen and injured themselves. They told him that it would cost between \$65,000 to \$150,000 to put in stairs. Rather than wait for the city to put in an expensive set of stairs, in July 2017 Astl took matters into his own hands, and hired a homeless man to help him build a set of wooden stairs. They completed the work in eight hours, at a total cost of just \$550 (later reimbursed through donations collected by a Toronto radio station.)

Once word of the “vigilante stairs” got out, the city moved to take the stairs down, arguing that they were unsafe, although Toronto Mayor John Tory thanked Astl for taking a stand on the issue and called the original cost estimates provided by the city “absolutely ridiculous.”

Within a week, a new set of concrete stairs was put in place by the city, with officials pegging the cost of the new stairs at \$10,000.

### Sources:

- CTV <https://www.ctvnews.ca/canada/toronto-man-builds-park-stairs-for-550-irking-city-after-65-000-estimate-1.3510237> July 19, 2017
- CTV <https://www.ctvnews.ca/canada/city-of-toronto-to-tear-down-550-park-stairs-says-man-who-built-them-1.3512364> July 20, 2017
- CNN <https://www.cnn.com/2017/07/20/americas/man-steps-trouble-trnd/index.html> July 21, 2017
- Global <https://globalnews.ca/news/3614167/tom-riley-park-stairs-removed-toronto/> July 21, 2017
- Toronto Star <https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2017/07/28/controversial-staircase-to-open-saturday-city-says.html> July 28, 2017

## Lifetime Achievement Award: The City of Calgary

*Nominated for: Most Gaffe-Prone Public Art Program*

### **Cost: At least \$30 million**

The City of Calgary has a long track record of wasting taxpayer dollars on public artwork stretching back to the inception of its public art policy in 2004, and Calgary public art projects garnered a Municipal Teddy nominee in 2015 and a winner in 2016. The [public art policy](#) has changed a bit over the years, but between 0.5% and 1% of the cost of a city project are required to be spent on public art.

Some of the more memorable examples of artistic waste include:

**Bearing (2009)** a \$221,000 large metal ball and metal archway that is located at the Calgary Fire Department's repair and maintenance facility, which rarely gets visitors from the public as the art is behind the fence that surrounds the facility.

**Wishing Well (2012)** the five metre tall interactive steel sphere allowed visitors to send text messages that were supposed to be translated into unique lights and sounds. Unfortunately, it didn't work properly, and the same default sound and lights were always displayed. This broken sculpture cost the City a total of \$559,000. In 2014, on a sunny day a visitor was texting a message to the sculpture, the mirrored surface of the sculpture concentrated the sun's rays and burned her jacket. The sculpture has been locked away in a city storage facility since.

**Traveling Light aka Giant Blue Ring (2013)** this \$470,000 giant blue ring with two lampposts on top of it does not count Calgary Mayor Naheed Nenshi among its fans. Upon seeing it at its unveiling in 2013, Mayor Nenshi declared "I don't like it, I think it's awful."

**Forest Lawn Lift Station (2015) aka the "Poop Palace"** a \$246,000 project which embedded LED lights that change color depending on how fast the station is pumping waste water.

**Bowfort Towers (2017)** created by a pair of New York artists, Bowfort Towers features four "sentinels" – steel beams which are intended to look rusty but has been criticized as looking like "bombed out ruins." Blackfoot artist Kalum Teke Dan also observed that the artwork resembles traditional Blackfoot burials where bodies were left in trees.

**SNAPSHOTS (2017)** This \$20,000 project, which features a series of blurred images with captions in the 4<sup>th</sup> Street SW underpass was later removed after it was discovered that the artist used copyrighted images without permission.

### **Sources:**

- Calgary Herald [A painful gallery of Calgary's public art stumbles](#) August 7, 2017
- National Post [Tristin Hopper: Why public art is so consistently awful](#) August 9, 2017
- Calgary Herald [Colin Craig: Calgary should copy Orlando's public art program](#) January 27, 2018
- CBC [No more surprises as Calgary to post upcoming public art online](#) November 6, 2017
- CBC [Public art policy suspended by Calgary city council pending review](#) September 14, 2017
- CTV [City seeks to delay majority of public art projects in Calgary](#) November 13, 2017



- National Post [Jen Gerson: All public art is bad public art. In Calgary, this is more true than anywhere](#) November 16, 2017
- Calgary Herald [City councillor calling for freeze to public arts funding](#) August 7, 2017
- Calgary Herald [Opinion: Controversy can't guide public art policy](#) September 8, 2017
- Global [Calgary city council suspends public arts policy](#) September 13, 2017
- CBC [Calgary mayor hopefuls agree on need for more public engagement on city art](#) August 29, 2017
- Canadian press [Calgary city council suspends public art program after controversies](#) September 14, 2017
- The Globe and mail [Scott Hennig Public art, private dollars: The example Calgary should follow](#)
- National Post <http://nationalpost.com/news/canada/after-470000-giant-blue-ring-that-nenshi-calls-awful-calgary-opts-to-review-generous-infrastructure-arts-funding> May 20, 2014
- Calgary Herald [Woman burned by public art comes forward](#) November 11, 2014
- Calgary Herald [Report shows fixing hazardous Calgary art display would cost \\$180,000](#) November 12, 2017
- City of Calgary video [Forest Lawn Lift Station](#) June 26, 2015
- City of Calgary [Forest Lawn Lift Station - Public Artwork](#)
- Calgary Herald [Calgary sewage art takes waste trophy](#) February 24, 2016
- CBC [Watershed+ public art project has Calgary residents raising a stink](#) September 28, 2015
- Huffington Post [Forest Lawn Lift Station Called 'Pretty Poop Palace' By Tax Watchdog](#) September 29, 2015
- City of Calgary [Great Plains Recreation Facility Public Art](#)
- National Post [After \\$470,000 'Giant Blue Ring' that Nenshi calls 'awful,' Calgary opts to review generous infrastructure arts funding](#) May 20, 2014
- Global ['It looks like a burial tower:' Controversy over Calgary's new public art project](#) August 6, 2017
- Calgary Herald [Artist apologizes for using comedy festival pictures in Calgary public art piece](#) November 30, 2017
- CTV [Calgary removing public artwork after British comedians spot their images](#) November 28, 2017