Life Plaza
734 - 7th Avenue S.W., Sulte 1350
Calgary, Alberta T2P 3P8
Canada

June 3, 2005

HayGroup

Ms. Annitta Stenning
Chief Administrative Officer
City of Winnipeg
510 Main Street
Winnipeg, Manitoba
R3B 1B9

Dear Ms. Stenning;

We have now completed a review of senior management positions at the City of Winnipeg, including the position of Chief Administrative Officer (CAO). This brief letter report provides the results of our market analysis that relied exclusively on Hay compensation databases.

Compensation Analysis

We had earlier evaluated the role of CAO at the City of Winnipeg based on a job content analysis. When I met with you earlier this year, we agreed that the role was substantively the same as two years ago, considering the complexity and scope of City operations. Therefore the evaluation was validated at 3536 Hay points, which was then used as the basis for accessing the Hay public sector and broader public sector databases.

As mentioned in earlier correspondence, our <u>public sector</u> database proved to be inadequate in terms of providing a sufficient number of observations to enable us to report on this sector. However, we do have sufficient observations within the <u>broader public sector</u> to be able to provide some insight into the national and western markets, for 'actual' remuneration levels only (note: there is no defined salary range structure at the City to enable us to compare the markets on a design or structural basis).

THE CITY OF WINNIPEG

JUN - 7 2005

CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE SECRETARIAT

We outline the result	of our market comparison	s in the table below.
-----------------------	--------------------------	-----------------------

•	Base Sa	Base Salary		ish	Bonus Pay	ments
_	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Design %	Actual %
Annitta Stanning	n/a	185,900	n/a	204,0007	10.0	9.7
National Broader Public Sector	r (N=11)			_		
P75	327,400	319,100	412,200	405,600	20.0	24.5
AVE	285,100	288,600	342,100	350,800	19.9	21.4
P50	271,600	260,000	302,300	270,500	16.0	10.5
P25	245,700	226,300	255,400	240,300	6,5	4.1
Western Broader Public Secto	r (N=7)					
AVE	289,900	263,000	348,200	313,200	20,0	19.
P50	271,200	247,100	301,900	262,100	12,9	8.
Variances vs Market P50 (usin	g City of Winnip	eg as the base)	•		17	
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	n/a	-40%	n/a	-33%	n/a	
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	n/a	-33%	· n/a	-28%	n/a.	r.

You will note that your position is remunerated well below both the national and western Canadian markets by -33% to -40% on base salary in relation to median market practices and -- 28% to - 33% on a total cash basis. You will also note that other broader public sector organizations provide higher bonus payments both on a design and actual level (16% and 10.5% of base salary at the median level). However, we believe at your senior Hay point level that such variable pay practices are likely most indicative of 'crown corporations' as opposed to municipal or other governmental organizations.

Conclusions

While the above information is a reflection of national market compensation practices, we point out that there were only 11 organizations in the national broader public sector market database at this senior level.

We also understand that the City has access to the results of a compensation survey undertaken for major municipalities in Canada that could provide further guidance in determining an equitable compensation level for the CAO position. This survey indicates that the average/median base salary for three other large western cities is \$221,000 and that the average salary for seven larger municipalities in Canada is \$215,000. Further information on this custom survey can be obtained from the City's human resource department.

When considering both data sets, it appears that the City of Winnipeg CAO position is remunerated below market at a base salary of about \$181,000. If the custom municipality survey data reflects both base salary and total cash compensation, the total cash compensation of the City of Winnipeg is still lagging the market at \$198,800. Naturally, City Council will also need to reflect on the performance of the incumbent in arriving at an equitable compensation program.

If you have any questions with respect to this letter report, feel free to call me in our Calgary offices at (403) 215-6740.

Yours truly,

David Payne

Regional Director

Life Plaza
734 - 7th Avenue S.W., Suite 1350
Calgary, Alberta T2P 3P8
Canada

June 3, 2005

HayGroup

Ms. Annitta Stenning
Chief Administrative Officer
City of Winnipeg
510 Main Street
Winnipeg, Manitoba
R3B 1B9

Dear Ms. Stenning;

We have now completed our analysis of the senior management positions at the City of Winnipeg consistent with the directions you provided me at our meeting of April/04 and having received the updated 2004 remuneration levels for City Director positions. We have outlined the terms of reference for this project, the compensation research process followed and the results of our analysis for your consideration and our future discussion.

Terms of Reference and Study Progress

The City of Winnipeg engaged Hay Management Consultants to undertake a review of all senior management roles at the City in relation to market pay practices. This project represents a periodic review of the Director's market compensation levels, as defined in their plan document.

We began the project by reviewing and updating the evaluation of all Director positions at the City including the:

- Chief Administrative Officer#
- Police Chief
- Chief Financial Officer
- Fire/Paramedic Chief
- Director, Public Works
- Director, Transit
- Director, Water and Waste
- Director, Community Services
- Director, IT/HR/Corporate Services*
- Chief HR/Corporate Services*
- Chief Information Officer*

RECEIVED

刊刊-7 2005

CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE SECRETARIAT

- Director, Planning/Property and Development
- City Assessor
- Deputy Police Chief
- Deputy Fire/Paramedic
- City Clerk
- * Currently, one incumbent is filling the position of Director, IT/HR/Corporate Services, however an evaluation and pricing was requested for the Chief HR/Corporate Services and a separate CIO position.

 # A separate letter report has been prepared for this role.

The updated evaluations for the above roles was done using the Hay method of job evaluation, as had been used in the original establishment of the Director's compensation program at the City of Winnipeg (refer to Appendix 1 for a brief overview of the Hay Plan). A summary of the updated evaluations has also been provided for your reference (refer to Exhibit 1).

These evaluations were used to access Hay's proprietary compensation databases that involved an assessment of 'total cash' compensation (i.e. base salary + bonus payments), on a national and Western Canadian basis for the public sector and broader public sector (i.e. public sector + crown corporations), at the median or P50 compensation level (note: the median is a very common market reference point at which organizations neither lead or lag the market).

In addition to accessing our compensation databases, we also undertook a supplementary survey of other Police departments in the Cities of Edmonton, Halifax, Hamilton, Regina and Vancouver (note: the Cities of Calgary and Saskatoon did not participate in this custom survey).

This 'draft' report highlights current market compensation data as of Sept/04 in comparison to City of Winnipeg actual total cash compensation levels (refer to Exhibit 4).

Compensation Research Findings and Conclusions

The detailed results of our compensation research are provided as an attachment to this report (refer to Appendix 3 for Hay database results and Appendix 4 for the custom Police survey). It is necessary to have an understanding of a few compensation definitions, as follows:

"Design" vs. "Actual" compensation – design base compensation references an organization's job rate (i.e. that salary to which satisfactory performing employees reach within a few years and typically plateau at until promoted) and is often the maximum of the salary range structure (min – max.) for base salary range. Design bonus compensation refers to the 'target' bonus level, that is, a bonus payment at target indicates that an incumbent has fulfilled his/her performance objectives.

Actual compensation refers to the current base salary and total cash actually being paid in the markets for which data is reported (i.e. can be below, at or above target levels).

National vs. Western markets — all Canadian locations vs. organizations reporting data that have employees in the prairie provinces and B.C. (refer to Appendix 2 for a listing of the organizations that comprise our national broader public and public sectors).

P75 and P50 Markets — using the 3rd quartile for assessing market pay practices in the public sector (P75) and the median for pay practices in the broader public sector (P50). Our analysis focuses on comparisons to these two markets, which are not distinct in that the public sector market is a subset of the broader public sector market. We note that many public sector organizations are adopting the broader public sector market for external comparison purposes, in order to attract and retain high quality staff.

We provide a summary of the results and related conclusions from our analysis of the '04 base salary and taxable allowance for each of the City's Director positions in Exhibit 1, with related commentary below. For analytical purposes we have focused on the national "actual" market (Sept/04 data) for both the public and broader public sector markets, with respect to pay levels that fall outside the range of +/-10% of each market. (Note: there was little difference between the national and western markets with respect to the data reported through our compensation databases).

An analysis based on 'actual' rates of pay provides a 'snapshot in time' for the positions under review (based on '04 compensation data).

- Chief of Police this position's base salary is greater than both the public sector (+3%) but less than the broader public sector P50 (-6%); this position competitive standing is virtually the same when considering total cash compensation (-4% to +3%) This finding is reinforced from a review of the custom police survey that indicates the Winnipeg Chief's actual base salary slightly behind the average reported salary of \$159,600 (-1%) for the six other City Police Chief positions. This role was also provided an 8% bonus payment last year bringing its total cash compensation to \$170,300. WITHIN MARKET.
- Chief Financial Officer this most senior financial role at the City, is remunerated below the broader public sector P50 market (-11%) and the public sector P75 market (-2%) with respect to base salary. However, this role is more competitive when considering total cash compensation in both markets (-0% and -7% respectively). WITHIN MARKET

- Chief Fire/Paramedics this role's compensation in comparison to the external market is almost the same as that of the CFO position, as noted above. WITHIN MARKET
- Director, Public Works this position is currently filled by a new incumbent during 2004, which could explain why a partial year actual remuneration is indicated to be behind the two markets for both base salary (-19% and -22%) and for total cash compensation compared to the broader public sector (-15% to -23%). BEHIND MARKET
- Director, Transit this position is currently vacant, therefore, we can not comment on its actual competitive standing.
- Director, Water & Waste the base salary provided to this role is lower than both the public P75 and broader public P50 data (-11% and -8%), which changes slightly when considering total cash compensation (-4% and -9%). WITHIN MARKET
- Director, Community Services similar to the Director, Waste and Water, this role is remunerated at a level below the market for on base salary (-10% and -11%) and total cash compensation (-7% and -10%). WITHIN MARKET
- Director HR/Corporate Services this 'combined' role is currently vacant therefore, we can not comment on its market competitive standing.
- Director, Planning/Property & Development the base salary for this role is lower than market pay levels (-6% and -7%) and close to market when considering total cash (-3% and -7%). WITHIN MARKET
- Chief Information Officer The CIO role as a stand-alone role is also remunerated slightly below the two markets on both base salary (-7%) and total cash compensation (-4% and -5%). WITHIN MARKET
- City Assessor this role is paid slightly more than market when considering base salary (+8% and +10%) and total cash compensation (+11%). WITHIN MARKET
- Deputy Chief of Police there are two Deputy Police Chief roles whose actual salary levels are different, in part due to the fact that one of the incumbents was hired or promoted into this role during 2004. However, both positions are remunerated at a level that approximates the market. WITHIN MARKET.
- Deputy Fire/Paramedics similar to the Deputy Police Chief roles these two Deputy roles are remunerated slightly differently, but quite comparable to the market. WITHIN MARKET.

- City Auditor while market data is provided for this role it is outside the scope for this review.
- City Clerk this is the only role that is currently remunerated at a level slightly higher than the market with respect to both base salary (+10% and +16%) and total cash compensation +23% and +26%. While information for this role is provided, as it reports directly to City Council, it is considered to be outside the scope of this review.

Overall, the City of Winnipeg's Director actual base salary and actual total cash compensation levels fall within the parameters of the external market.

However, in turning our attention to 'design' compensation levels we note that eight of the senior position 'structures' at the City are behind the broader public sector market by anywhere from -15% to -25% in some cases. This means that other broader public sector organizations and public sector organizations have more latitude than does the City of Winnipeg to remunerate their senior staff at higher compensation levels in the future. In other words, the design of other organizations' base salary ranges and their variable pay plans allows them greater scope/flexibility to increase remuneration levels to senior staff than do comparable practices at the City of Winnipeg.

We provide a summary by position in exhibit 2 that outlines the extent to which the City of Winnipeg's pay 'structures' fall behind both the public and broader public sectors. We tend to focus more on total cash compensation vs. base salary levels. On average, the total cash compensation for the top 8 Director positions is below the 'design' market levels by approximately -15%.

Concluding Comments

Some of the above compensation research findings will likely not come as a surprise, considering the fact that a formal external market analysis has not been undertaken for the past 3 year period, even though Directors have received pay increases during this period and there is a timing difference regarding the reported data (Jan/04 City salary levels vs. Sept/04 Hay compensation database information). There is some latitude within the City's current compensation structure to adjust the 1-2 positions indicated as being below market, particularly after increasing the range structure by a further 3% as an economic adjustment for the '05 fiscal period. This of course assumes the performance of a position incumbent merits an adjustment. Our detailed "design" analysis indicates that market salary range structures exceed the City's salary range structure for more senior roles by 15% to 25% + (i.e. to positions above the City Assessor role).

The City has also questioned the value of its modest variable pay program that pays up to 10% of base salary to individual Directors. Our analysis indicates that many broader public sector and some public sector organizations are offering similar programs tied to the determination of specific performance objectives, typically at the business unit and corporate levels, for more senior roles (in the range of 5 - 7% of base salary, as you will note in appendix 3). Any concerns regarding the variable pay program may have more to do with a requirement to develop or refine a more formal performance measurement framework?

If you have any questions with respect to this final summary report, please feel free to call me in our Calgary offices at (403) 215-6740.

Yours truly,

David Payne

Regional Director

Appendix 1
The Hay Method of Job Evaluation

Hay Job Evaluation Method

The Hay Guide Chart-Profile method is based on Hay's long experience with both private and public sector clients. The method was first constructed to be a job evaluation technique, but its broader application in both job and organizational analysis has made it a useful management tool. Two principles are fundamental to the Guide Chart-Profile method:

- an understanding of the content of the job to be measured; and
- * the direct comparison of one job with another job to determine relative value.

The comparison is made between different aspects of total job content, defined as know-how, problem solving and accountability. The sum of these measures, expressed in job evaluation "points", represents the value of the whole job. The three elements are further refined and assessed, as follows:

Know How

This factor measures the total of every kind of knowledge and skill, however acquired, needed for acceptable job performance. Three dimensions are considered:

- practical procedures and knowledge, specialized techniques, and learned skills;
- planning, coordinating, directing or controlling the activities and resources associated with an organizational unit or function; and
- active, practicing, person-to-person skills in the area of human relationships.

Problem Solving

This factor measures the thinking required in the job by considering two dimensions:

- the environment in which the thinking takes place;
 and
- the challenge presented by the thinking to be done.

Accountability

This factor measures the relative degree to which the job, when performed competently, can affect the end results of the organization or a unit within the organization. The opportunity to contribute to an organization is reflected through dimensions such as:

- * the nature and degree of the decision-making or influence of the job;
- the unit or function most clearly affected by the job; and
- the magnitude/size of a unit or function most clearly affected by a job.

Appendix 2

Hay Database Participant Listings – National Broader Public Sector & National Public Sector

National Broader Public Sector Participant List (N = 127)

Data as of September 1, 2004

ATB Financial
Alberta Blue Cross
Atlantic Lottery Corporation

Bank of Ganada

Bluewater District School Board

Bluewater Power Distribution Corporation British Columbia Hydro and Power Authority British Columbia Securities Commission Business Development Bank of Canada

CAA Manitoba

Calgary Board of Education

Calgary Catholic Separate School District

Calgary Exhibition and Stampede

Calgary Health Region Calgary Public Library

Calgary Zoo

Canada Deposit Insurance Corporation
Canada Lands Company CLC Limited
Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation

Canada Post Corporation

Canadian Broadcasting Corporation
Canadian Corps of Commissionaires

Canadian Forces Personnel Support Agency
Canadian Institute of Chartered Accountants
Canadian Life and Health Insurance Association Inc.

Canadian Payments Association

Canadian Wood Council
Carleton University

Chatham-Kent Health Alliance

The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints Canada

City of Brockville
City of Calgary
City of Edmonton
City of Kamloops
City of Kelowna
City of Moncton
City of Nanalmo
Dalhousle University

Deposit Insurance Corporation of Ontario

EPCOR

Edmonton Catholic Schools Electricity Distributors Association Enersource Hydro Miselssauga

FINTRAC .

Farm Credit Canada

Federal Co-operative Housing Stabilization Fund

Financial Planners Standards Council

Fonds d'assurance de la chambre des notaires du Quebec

GO Transit
Goodwill Toronto
Government of Alberta

Government of Canada - Treasury Board

Government of New Brunswick

Government of Newfoundland and Labrador

Government of Northwest Territories

Government of Nova Scotla
Government of Nunavut
Government of Onlarlo
Government of Saskatchewan
Greater Sudbury Hydro Plus

Hallfax Porl Authority

Halifax Regional Water Commission Halifax-Dartmouth Bridge Commission

Hamilton Port Authority

The Hamilton Wentworth District School Board

Health Sciences Centre - Winnipeg

Hydro One Brampton Inc.

Hydro One Inc. Hydro-Québec

Institut national de la recherche scientifique Insurance Corporation of British Columbia Investment Dealers Association of Canada

LCBO

McGIII University McMester University

Memorial University of Newfoundland

National Ballet School

Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada

The Nature Conservancy
New Brunswick Power Corporation
Newfoundland and Labrador Hydro
Northwest Territories Power Corporation

Nova Scotla Association of Health Organizations Office of the SuperIntendent of Financial Institutions

Ontario Federation of Agriculture Ontario Power Generation Onlario Securities Commission Ordre des ingénieurs du Québec Oshawa PUC Networks Inc.

PAPRICAN

Parc Downsview Park
Pathways to Independence
Real Estate Council of Ontario
Régie des Installations olympiques
Regina Exhibition Association Limited

Regina Police Service

Regina Qu'Appelle Health Region

Royal Canadian Mint

SOCAN

St. Boniface General Hospital Saskatchewan Cancer Agency

Saskatchewan Healthcare Employees' Pension Plan (SHEPP

National Broader Public Sector Participant List (N = 127)

Saskatchewan Housing Authoritles Saskatchewan Institute of Applied Science and Technology Saskatchewan Telecommunications Saskatchewan Workers' Compensation Board Saskatoon Health Region SaskEnergy Incorporated SaskPower Société des Loteries du Québec et fillales TV Ontario Toronto Hydro Corporation Toronto Transit Commission The United Church of Canada United Way of the Alberta Capital Region University College of Cape Breton University of Lethbridge University of New Brunswick University of Winnipeg VisitBritain Wine Council of Ontario The Workers' Compensation Board - Alberta Workers' Compensation Board of Manitoba Workers' Compensation Board of Nova Scotia Workplace Health Safety & Compensation Comm. of Nfld. & Lab Workplace Health, Safety and Compensation Commission of N.B. Workplace Safety and insurance Board

Total: 127 Organizations

National Public Sector Participant List (N = 61)

Data as of September 1, 2004

Bluewater District School Board Calgary Board of Education

Calgary Catholic Separate School District

Calgary Health Region Calgary Public Library

Canadian Forces Personnel Support Agency

Carleton University

Chathem-Kent Health Alliance

The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints Canada

City of Brockville

City of Calgary

City of Edmonton

City of Kamloops .

City of Kelowna

City of Monoton

City of Nanalmo

Dalhousic University

Edmonton Catholic Schools

FINTRAC

Goodwill Toronto.

Government of Alberta

Government of Canada - Treasury Board

Government of New Brunswick

Government of Newfoundland and Labrador

Government of Northwest Territorics

Government of Nova Scotia

Government of Nunavut

Government of Ontario

Government of Saskatchewan

The Hamilton Wentworth District School Board

Health Sciences Centre - Winnipeg

Institut national de la recherche scientifique

McGili University

McMaster University

Mcmorial University of Newfoundland

National Ballet School

Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada

The Nature Conservancy

Nova Scotia Association of Health Organizations

Páthways to Independencé

Regina Police Service

Regina Qu'Appelle Health Region

St. Boniface General Hospital

Saskatchewan Cancer Agency

Saskatchewan Healthcare Employees' Pension Plan (SHEPP)

Saskatchewan Housing Authorities

Saskatchewan Institute of Applied Science and Technology

Saskatchewan Workers' Compensation Board

Saskatoon Health Region

The United Church of Canada

United Way of the Alberta Capital Region

University College of Cape Breton

University of Lathbridge

University of New Brunswick

University of Winnipeg

The Workers' Compensation Board - Alberta

Workers' Compensation Board of Manitoba

Workers' Compensation Board of Nova Scotia

Workplace Health Safety & Compensation Comm. of Nfld. & Lab

Workplace Heelth, Safety and Compensation Commission of N.B.

Workplace Safety and Insurance Board

Total: 61 Organizations

Appendix 3

Hay Database Results

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Chief of Police Survey Points: 2028

Total Cash Bonus Payments Base Salary Design Actual Design Design % Actual Actual % 154,000 10.0 10.0 144,700 154,000 159,200 Jack Ewatski National Broader Public Sector (Market 1) (N=56) 236,200 288,300 306,500 29.8 36.2 P90 246,600 19.3 197,800 245,900 230,800 19.3 P75 206,800 12.6 14.6 **AVE** 174,600 203,400 200,100 180,500 P50 173,900 167,400 190,900 177,200 4:9 . 4.6 0.0 145,900 147,700 P25. 147,100 149,700 0.0 P10 126,200 126,200 126,200 126,200 0.0 0.0 National Public Sector (Market 2) (N=29) P90 182,100 190,900 218,300 10.5 10.3 191,400 P75 165,900 153,300 166,800 165,600 5.2 0.0 ۸VE 146,500 151,000 155,900 150,400 3.3 2.6 -P50 145,700 143,800 146,200 146,200 0.0 0.0 P25 129,100 128,700 129,100 128,700 0.0 0.0 P10 103,500 106,200 103,500 106,200 0,0 0.0 Western Broader Public Sector (Market 3) (N=28) 241,900 224,200 304,200 297,500 31.5 40.1 P75 209,500 190,000 212,400 15.3 254,000 13.6 AVE 174,500 185,800 211,000 199,600 13.5 14.4 P50 177,200 167,300 176,400 10,0 195,800 5.8 P25 150,200 150,900 165,200 164,500 0.0 0.0 P10 139,100 138,300 139,100 139,100 0.0 0.0 Western Public Sector (Market 4) (N=11) P90 P75 187,500 152,500 · 198,000 168,400 10.3 10.3 AVE 157,700 150,000 167,000 157,700 5.9 5.1 P60 150,000-149,800 163,400 158,200 0.0 0.0 P25 138,700 139,900 139,900 0.0 0.0 139,900 P10 Variances vs Market P75 (using City of Winnipeg as the base) -5% vs. National PS (Market 2) -15% +7% +5% vs. Western PS (Market 4) -30% +3% -24% -3% Variances vs Market P50 (using City of Winnipeg as the base) -9% -15% vs. National BPS (Market 1) -20% -20% vs. Western BPS (Market 3) -22% -9% -23% . -15%

[&]quot;Market Data as of September 2004

City of Winnipag

Job Title: Chief Financial Officer

urvey Points: 2028				1/3			
•	Base Sa	alary ·	Total C	ash 🔪	Bonus Payments		
,	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Design %	Actual 1/4	
Robert Gannon	144,700	146,800	159,200	161,500	10.0	10.0	
National Broader Public Sec	tor (Market 1) (N	=56)				,	
P90	246,600	236,200	288,300	306,500	29.8	36.2	
P76	206,800	197,800	245,900	230,800	19,3	19.3	
AVE	180,500	174,600	203,400	200,100	12.6	1.1	
P50	173,900	167,400	190,900	177,200	4.9	4.6	
P25	147,100	145,900	149,700	147,700	0.0	0.0	
P10 .	126,200	126,200	126,200	126,200	0,0	0.0	
National Public Sector (Mark	ret 2) (H=29)						
P90	191,400	182,100	218,300	190,900	10.5	,10.3	
P75	165,900	153,300	166,800	165,600	5.2	0.0	
AVE	161,000	146,500	155,900	150,400	3,3	2.6	
P50	146,700	143,800	146,200	146,200	0.0	. 0.0	
P26	129,100	128,700	129,100	128,700	0,0	0.0	
P10	103,500	106,200	103,500	106,200	0.0	0.0	
Western Broader Public Sec	tor (Harket 3) (h	l=2 %)					
P90	241,900	224,200	304,200	297,500	31.5	40.1	
P75	209,500	190,000	254,000	212,400	15,3	13.6	
AVE	185,800	174,600	211,000	199,600	13.5	14.4	
P50	177,200	167,300	195,800	176,400	10,0		
P26	150,900	160,200	166,200	164,500	0.0	0.0	
P10	139,100	138,300	139,100	139,100	0.0	0,0	
Western Public Sector (Mart	ket 4) (N=11)						
P90							
P75	187,600	152,500	198,000	168,400	10.3	10.3	
AVE	157,700	150,000	167,000	157,700	5.9	5.1	
P60	160,000	149,800	163,400	158,200	0,0	0,0	
P25	139,900	138,700	139,900	139,900	0.0	0.0	
P10							
Variances vs Market P75 (us	ing City of Winr	nipeg as the bas	e)			•	
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-15%	-4%	-5%	-3%			
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-30%	-4%	-24%	-4%	•		
Variances ve Market P50 (us	ing City of Wint	nipeg as the bas	e)				
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-20%	-14%	-20%	-10%			
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-22%	-14%	-23%	-9%			

^{*}Market Data as of September 2004

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Chief Fire!Paramedics Survey Points: 1868

Survey Points: 1868	haan Salami		Todal Co		Bonus Payments		
	Base 8a Design	iary Actual	Total Ca Design	Actual	Design %	Actual %	
-	Design	7000	Design	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			
Nes Shoemaker	144,700	140,900	159,200	155,000	10.0	10.0	
National Broader Public Sect	or (Market 1) (N	=63)					
P90	226,400	215,700	259,800	272,600	27.5	33.0	
P75	191,700	185,300	228,000	212,200	18.3	19.0	
AVE	169,200	163,600	189,000	1,85,700	. 11.7	13.4	
P60	167,300	160,000	180,700	170,300	5.0	3,7	
P25	139,400	137,900	142,800	140,900	0.0	0.0	
P10	115,000	117,100	116,000	117,100	0.0	0.0	
National Public Sector (Mark	ret 2) (N=33)						
P90	178,600	173,200	202,300	1\$1,200	10.3	9.4	
P76	161,100	148,900	163,300	160,200	5.7	0,0	
AVE	143,000	139,300	147,800	143,000	3.4	2.7	
P50	138,100	136,200	140,700	139,800	. 0.0	0,0	
P25	120,800	121,800	120,800	121,800	0.0	0.0	
P10 .	98,600	100,900	98,600	100,900	0,0	0.0	
Western Broader Public Sec	tor (Market 3) (N	i=30)		•			
P90	217,400	213,600	264,300	276,600	29.7	39,4	
P75	194,100	180,600	235,600	203,400	17.8	17.1	
AVE	174,700	166,000	197,800	190,700	13.2	14:9	
P50	170,100	169,900	189,200	172,100	10,0	7.1	
P25	143,800	142,600	154,000	153,900	0.0	0,0	
P10	134,900	133,600	136,100	136,600	0.0	0,0	
Western Public Sector (Mari	ket 4) (N=17)						
P90	177,600	160,900	205,000	181,200	15.5	16.1	
P75 ,	175,700	148,500	186,800	164,500	10.2	9.2	
AVE	150,400	143,900	159,800	151,700	6,3	5.4	
P50	142,500	142,800	152,100	148,000	0.0	0.0	
P25	135,200	134,300	136,600	136,300	0.0	0.0	
P10	126,100	124,700	126,300	124,700	0.0	0,0	
Variances us Market P75 (us	ing City of Wine	nipeg as the bas	e)		•		
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-11%	-6%	-3%	3%	•	•	
vs. Western PS (Warket 4)	-21%	-5%	-17%	-6%			
Variances vs Market P50 (us	sing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	· (e)				
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-16%	-14%	-14%	-10%			
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-18%	-13%	-19%		٠.		

^{*}Market Data as of September 2004

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Director Public Works Survey Points: 1708

Survey Points: 1708	ey Points: 1708 Base Salary		Total Cash			Bonus Payments		
	Base Sa Design	nary Actual	Design	asn Actual#	Design %	yments Actual %		
Bill Larkin	129,500	124,000	142,500	136,400	10.0	10.0		
National Broader Public Sector	r (Market 1) (N=68	3)						
P90	204,900	196,500	243,600	240,300	25.9	28.4		
P75	174,600	173,000	208,200	194,600	17.1	18.8		
AVE	157,500	153,900	175,000	172,300	11.1	11.9		
P50	159,500	151,700	170,900	163,700	• 6.5	3.8		
P25	133,300	131,200	138,700	137,300	0.0	0.0		
P10	103,600	108,600	103,600	108,600	0.0	0.0		
National Public Sector (Market	t 2) (N=37)	•						
P90	166,900	166,600	181,100	173,000	10.1	8.4		
P75	157,400	147,300	162,600	157,100	6.7	0.0		
ΛVE	135,100	133,000	139,900	136,700	3.6	2.8		
P50	132,100	130,500	138,200	136,100	0.0	0.0		
P25	112,400	115,400	112,400	115,400	0.0	0:0		
P10 ·	95,300	97,100	95,300	97,100	0.0	0.0		
Western Broader Public Sector	or (Market 3) (N=3	1)						
P90	191,100	199,000	226,400	254,100	29.2	37.7		
P75	175,400	170,400	211,200	191,800	22.9	21.7		
AVE	162,300	156,700	183,700	180,700	13.2	15.3		
P50	163,400	151,400	183,100	168,100	10.0	8.		
P25	137,600	135,400	141,700	142,200	0.0	0.0		
P10	130,100	128,100	133,000	131,800	0.0	0.		
Western Public Sector (Marke	t 4) (N=18)							
P90	166,100	153,900	202,200	174,800	22.5	20.		
P75	162,100	146,200	173,600	163,100	10.1	7.		
AVE	143,000	138,600	152,800	146,600	6.9	5.		
P50	135,900	136,600	141,200	140,100	0.0	. 0.		
P25	130,200	129,800	133,300	132,700	0.0	0.		
P10	126,700	124,600	127,000	124,600	0.0	0.		
Variances vs Market P75 (usin	ng City of Winnip	eg as the base)						
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-22%	-5%	-14%	0%.				
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-25%	-10%	-22%	-3%				
Variances vs Market P50 (usi	ng City of Winnip	eg as the base)			•			
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-23%	-22%	-20%	-20%				
vs. Western BPS (Market 9)	-26%	-10%	-28%	-23%				

^{*} Market Data as of September 2004 # Actual Salary increased by 10% (I.e. no actual bonus yet paid to new incumbent)

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Director, Transit Survey Points: 1708

Survey Points: 1708	Base Salary		Total Ca	ash	Bonus Payments		
	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Design %	Actual %	
Rick Borland#	129,500	139,800	142,500	163,800	10.0	10.0	
National Broader Public Sector	r (Market 1) (N=68)			•		
P90	204,900	196,500	243,600	240,300	25.9 [,]	28.4	
P75	174,600	173,000	208,200	194,600	17.1	18.8	
AVE	157,500	153,900	175,000	172,300	11.1	11.9	
P50	159,500	151,700	170,900	163,700	• 6.5	1: 3.8	
P25	193,300	131,200	138,700	137,300	0.0		
P10	103,600	108,600	103,600	108,600 ,	0.0	0.0	
National Public Sector (Market	2) (N=37)			•			
P90	166,900	166,600	181,100	173,000	10.1	8.4	
P75	157,400	147,300	162,600	157,100	6.7	0.0	
AVE	135,100	133,000	139,900	136,700	3.6	2.8	
P50	132,100	130,500	138,200	136,100	0:0	0.0	
P25	112,400	115,400	112,400	115,400	0.0	0.0	
PIO	95,300	97,100	95,300	97,100	0.0		
Western Broader Public Secto	r (Market 3) (N=31	1)					
P90	191,100	199,000	228,400	254,100	29.2	37.7	
P75	175,400	170,400	211,200	191,800	22,9	21.7	
AVE	162,300	156,700	183,700	180,700	13.2	15.3	
P50	163,400	151,400	183,100	168,100	10.0	8.7	
P25	137,600	135,400	141,700	142,200	0.0	0.0	
P10	130,100	128,100	133,000	131,800	0.0	, 0.0	
Western Public Sector (Market	t 4) (N=18)				•	•	
P90	166,100	153,900	202,200	174,800	22.5	20.	
P75	162,100	146,200	173,600	163,100	10.1	7.	
AVE	143,000	138,600	152,800	146,600	6.9	5.	
P50	135,900	136,600	141,200	140,100	0.0	. 0.	
P25	130,200	129,800	133,300	132,700	0.0	0.	
P10	126,700	124,600	127,000	124,500	0.0	0.	
Variances vs Market P75 (usir	ng City of Winnipe	g as the base)					
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-22%	-5%	-14%	-2%	•		
vs. Westorn PS (Market 4)	-25%	-5%	-22%	-6%			
Variances vs Market P50 (usin	ng City of Winnipe	g as the baso)		•			
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-23%	9%	-20%	-6%	•		
vs. Western BPS (Markel 3)	-26%	-8%	-28%	-9%			

^{*} Market Data as of September 2004 # Former position incumbent

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Director Water & Waste



urvey Points: 1708				,5		
•	Base Sa	alary	Total Ca	ash	Bonus Payments	
	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Design %	Actual %
Bany Macbride	129,600	130,500	142,500	143,600	10.0	10.0
National Broader Public Sec	tor (Narket 1) (N	=68)		•		
P90	204,900	196,500	243,600	240,300	25,9	28,4
P75	174,600	173,000	208,200	194,600	17.1	18.8
AVE	157,500	153,900	175,000	172,300	11.1	. 11.9
P50	159,500	151,700	170,900	163,700	6.5	3.8
F25	133,300	131,200	138,700	137,300	0.0	0.0
P10	103,600	108,600	103,600	108,600	0.0	0,0
National Public Sector (Mari	ket 2) (N=37)					•
P90	166,900	166,600	181,100	173,000	10.1	8.4
P75	157,400	147,300	162,600	167,100	6.7	0,0
AVE	135,100	133,000	139,900	136,700	3.6	2.8
P50	132,100	130,500	138,200	136,100	0.0	0.0
P25	112,400	115,400	112,400	115,400	0.0	0,0
P10	95,300	97,100	95,300	97,100	0.0	0.0
Western Broader Public Sec	tor (Harket 3) (N	l=31)		,		
P90	191,100	199,000	228,400	. 254,100	29.2	37.7
P75	175,400	170,400	211,200	191,800	22,9	21.7
AVE	162,300	156,700	1\$3,700	180,700	13.2	15,3
P50	163,400	161,400	183,100	168,100	10.0	8.7
P25	137,600	135,400	. 141,700	142,200	0.0	0.0
P10	130,100	123,100	133,000	131,800	0.0	0.0
Western Public Sector (Har	ket 1) (N=18)					
P90	166,100	153,900	202,200	174,800	22.5	20.
P75 ·	162,100	146,200	173,600	163,100	10.1	7.
AVE .	143,000	138,600	152,800	146,600	6,9	5.
P60.	135,900	136,600	141,200	140;100	0,0	0.
P25 .	130,200	129,800	133,300	132,700	0.0	0.
P10	126,700	124,600	127,000	124,600	0.0	0.
Variances vs klarket P75 (us	sing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	e)			
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-22%	-13%	-1 4%	-9%		
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-26%	-12%	-22%	-14%		
Variances ve Market P50 (u	sing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	e)			•
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-23%	-16%	-20%	-14%		
vs. Hallurial pro (Warker)						

^{*}Market Data as of September 2004

Appendix 3

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Director, Community Services Survey Points: 1628

Survey Points: 1628	Base Sa	Jarv	Total Ca	sh	Bonus Pa	yments
	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Design %	Actual %
Irsula Stelman	129,500	130,000	142,500	143,000	10.0	10.0
lational Broader Public Sect	tor (Market 1) (N	=72)			·	
P90	194,300	187,400	233,200	225,900	25.3	26,6
F75	166,400	166,500	197,800	186,200	16.4	18.2
AVE	151,300	148,800	167,500	165,200	10.7	. 11.0
P50	154,100	146,600	164,500	168,700	6.3	3.5
P25	129,900	127,500	135,600	.134,3001	0.0	0.0
P10	99,400	105,200	99,400	105,200	0.0	0.0
National Public Sector (Mark	ret 2) (N=39)					
P90	161,100	162,600	171,700	168,900	9.8	7.9
P76 ·	153,700	146,100	160,100	151,100	6,7	0,0
AVE	131,200	129,800	135,800	133,400	3.5	2.7
P50	129,300	127,600	136,000	133,500	0.0	0.0
P25	109,600	112,900	109,600	112,900	0.0	0.0
P10	93;700	95,300	93,700	95,300	0.0	0.0
Western Broader Public Sec	tor (Harket 3) (k	l=31)				
P90	180,000	. 191,300	212,700	241,000	28.1	36,0
P76	166,500	164,700	198,400	185,500	23.3	21.3
AVE	155,700	151,500	175,400	174,000	12.6	14.
P50 ·	158,100	146,500	176,900	163,500	9.4	8.
P25	134,300	131,700	136,200	· 136,700	0.0	0.
P10	127,200	124,300	130,300	128,900	0,0	٥.
Westein Public Sector (Mar	ket 4) (N=18)		•			
P90.	159,400	150,400	195,700	170,000	23.4	. 20.
P75.	164,700	143,800	166,900	160,000	9.7	6.
AVE	138,900	135,600	148,200	143,100	6.7	5.
P50	132,800	133,400	136,200 .	136,200	0.0	0
P26	127,600	127,200	130,900	130,300	0.0	•
P10	125,600	123,300	126,100	123,300	0.0	0
Variances vs. Market P75 (us	sing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	e)			
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-19%	-12%	-12%	-8%		
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-19%	-11%	-16%	-12%		
Variances vs Market P50 (us	sing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	se)			
vs. National BPS (Markel 1)	-19%	-13%	-15%	-11%		
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-22%	-13 %	-24%	-14%		

^{*}Market Data as of September 2004

City of Winnipeg.

Job Title: Director IT/HR/Corporate Servcies Survey Points: 1628

Survey Points: 1628	Base Salary		Total C	ash	Bonus Payments		
_	Design	Actual	Design	actual	Design %	Actual 1/4	
Clifford Jeffers	129,500	120,700	142;500	132,800	10.0	10.0	
National Broader Public Sect	tor (Market 1) (N	≃72)					
P90	194,300	187,400	233,200	225,900	25.3	26,6	
P76	166,400	166,500	197,800	186,200	16.4	18.2	
AVE	161,300	148,800	167,600	165,200	10.7	- 11.0	
P50	154,100	146,600	164,500	168,700	6.3	3.5	
P25	129,900	127,600	135,600	134,300 -	0.0	0,0	
P1-0	99,400	105,200	99,400	105,200	0,0	0,0	
National Public Sector (Nark	et 2) (N=39)						
P30	161,100	162,600	171,700	168,900	9.8	7,9	
P75	153,700	145,100	160,100	154,100	6.7	0.0	
AVE	131,200	129,800	135,800	133,400	3,5	2.7	
P\$0	129,300	127,800	136,000	133,600	0.0	0.0	
P26	109,600	112,900	109,500	112,900	0.0	0,0	
P10	93,700	95,300	93,700	95,300	. 0.0	0,0	
Western Broadsr Public Sec	tor (Market 3) (N	=31)					
P90	1:80,000	191,300	212,700	241,000	28.1	36.0	
P75	166,500	164,700	198,400	185,600	23.3	21.8	
AVE	155,700	151,600	175,400	174,000	12.6	14.7	
P50	158,100	146,500	176,900	163,500	9.4	8,8	
P25	134,300	131,700	136,200	136,700	0.0	0.0	
P10	127,200	124,800	130,300	128,900	0.0	0,0	
Western Public Sector (Mark	(et 4) (H=18)	•				•	
P90 .	169,400	150,400	195,700	170,000	23.4	20,4	
P75	154,700	143,800	165,900	160,000	9.7	6.9	
AVE	138,900	135,600	148,200	143,100	6.7	5.6	
P50	132,800	133,400	136,200	136,200	0.0	0.0	
P25	127,500	127,200	130,900	130,300	0.0	0,0	
P10	125,600	123,300	126,100	123,300	0,0	0.0	
Variances vs klarket P75 (us	ing City of Wint	ripeg as the bas	e)				
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-19%	-20%	-12%	-16%			
vs. Weslern PS (Market 4)	-19%	-19%	-16%	-20%			
Variances vs Market P50 (us	ing City of Wind	nipeg as the bas	e)				
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-19%	-21%	-15%	-20%			
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-22%	-21%	-24%	-23%			

^{*}Market Data as of September 2004

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Director, Planning, Property & Development Survey Points: 1528

1401.380

Survey Politis: 1026	Base Sa	larv	Total Ca	ish '	Bonus Pa	umente
,	Dasign	Actual	Design	Actual	Design %	Actual %
larry Finnigan	129,600	135,000	142,500	148,600	10.0	10.0
National Broader Public Sect	or (Market 1) (14	=7 2)				
P90	194,300	187,400	233,200	226,900	25.3 ·	26.6
P75 .	166,400	166,500	197,800	186,200	16.4	18.2
AVE	151,300	148,800	167,500	165,200	10.7	11.0
P60	154,100	146,600	164,500	158,700	6.3	3,5
P25	129,900	127,500	135,600	134,300.	٥,٥	0.0
P10	99,400	105,200	99,400	105,200	0.0	0.0
lational Public Sector (Nark	et 2) (N=39)					
P90	161,100	162,600	171,700	168,900	9.8	7,9
P75	153,700	145,100	160,100	154,100	6.7	0,0
AVE	131,200	129,800	135,800	133,400	3,6	2.7
P50	129,300	127,600	136,000	133,500	0,0	0.0
P25	109,600	112,900	109,600	112,900	0.0	0.0
P10	93,700	96,300	93,700	95,300	0,0	0.0
Western Broader Public Sec	tor (Harket 3) (N	l=31)	,			
P90	180,000	191,300	212,700	241,000	28.1	36.0
F75	166,500	164,700	198,400	185,500	23.3	21.8
AVE	155,700	151,500	175,400	174,000	12.6	14.
P50	158,100	146,500	176,900	163,500	9.4	8,
P25	134,300	131,700	136,200	136,700	0.0	0.
P10	127,200	124,800	130,300	128,900	0.0	. 0.
Westem Public Sector (Mark	cet 4) (N=18)					
P90	159,400	150,400	195,700	170,000	23.4	20
P75	154,700	143,800	165,900	160,000	9.7	. 6.
AVE	138,900	135,600	148,200	143,100	6.7	5.
P50	132,800	133,400	136,200	136,200	0.0	0.
P25	127,500	1,27,200	130,900	130,300	0.0	٥
P10	125,600	123,300	126,100	123,300	0.0	. 0
Variances ve Market P75 (us	ing City of Winr	nipeg as the base	e)		•	
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-19%	-7%	-12%	-4%		
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-19%	-7%	-16%	-8%		
Variances vs Market P50 (us	ing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	e)			
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-19%	9%	-1596	-7%	•	
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-22%	-9%	-24%	-10%		

^{*}Market Data as of September, 2004

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Chief Information Officer

Survey Points: 1560			,			
	Base Sa	•	Total Ca		Bonus Pa	-
	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Dosign W	Actual 14
Clifford Jeffers	129,500	120,700	142,500	132,800	10,0	10,0
National Broader Public Sect	or (Market 1) (N	=77)				
Pao	186,500	181,700	221,100	217,900	25.2	26.2
P75	160,500	161,200	188,900	120,800	16.7	16.9
AVE	146,100	144,200	160,900	.159,100	10.1	10.2
P50	147,600	141,200	167,000	151,900	4.6	2.5
P25	126,800	124,200	131,300	129,600 •	0.0	0.0
P10	99,000	104,100	99,000	104,100	0,0	0.0
National Public Sector (Mark	et 2) (N=41)					
P90	166,600	168,000	167,000	165,900	9.1	7.5
P75	147,400	141,100	154,000	149,200	. 6,0	0.0 1
AVE	128,300	127,500	132,500	130,700	3,3	2.5
P50	127,600	125,500	132,600	130,200	0.0	0.0
P25	110,200	112,300	110,200	112,300	0,0	0,0
P10	92,600	94,300	92,500	94,300	0,0	0,0
Western Broader Public Sec	tor (Harket 3) (1	1=33)			•	
P90	175,500	184,300	204,800	227,800	25.9	0, 88
P75	160,900	159,000	187,600	179,600	18.6	17.7
AVE	149,900	146,700	166,900	165,900	11,2	12.8
P60	160,600	141,600	166,400	155,500	7.9	7.3
P25	131,400	128,700	132,900	133,200	0.0	0.0
P10	123,900	121,200	126,300	124,800	0,0	0.0
Western Public Sector (Mar	ket 4) (N=19)					
P90	152,700	147,800	181,300	163,400	['] 19.0	16,6
P76	147,900	139,700	157,900	153,100	9.0	6.3
AVE	134,900	132,600	142,700	138,700	5.7	4.6
P50	130,600	130,800	133,400	133,200	0.0	0.0
P25	125,100	124,800	127,700	127,400	0.0	0.0
P10 ⁻	122,300	120,100	122,800	120,100	0.0	0.0
Variances vs klarket P75 (us	ring City of Win	nipeg as the bas	c)	•		
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-14%	-17%	-8%	-12%	•	:
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-14%	-16%	-11%	-15%		
Variances vs Market P50 (us	ing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	e)			
ys, National BPS (Market 1)	-14%	-17%	-10%	-14%		
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-16%	-17%	-17%	-17%		•

^{*}Market Data as of September 2004

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: City Assessor

urvey Points: 1418			•			•	
•	Base S	alary .	Total C	ash	Bonus Payments		
	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Design 14	Actual %	
M. Moore	129,500	134,000	142,500	147,400	10.0	10.0	
National Broader Public Sec	tor (klarket 1) (k	l=88)					
P90	170,200	169,700	195,900	201,400	25.0	25.3	
P75	148,300	150,000	170,300	169,600	14:1	14.2	
AVE	135,300	134,700	147,300	-146,300	* \$.8	3,6	
P50	133,600	129,800	141,400	137,700	0.9	0.6	
P25	120,300	117,200	122,300	119,800	0.0	0.0	
P10	98,300	101,800	98,300	101,800	0.0	0.0	
National Public Sector (Mar	ket 2) (N=46)						
P90	147,200	148,500	157,100	159,600	7.8	6.7	
P75	134,300	132,600	141,300	139,000	4.4	- 0.0	
AVE	122,300	122,600	125,600	125,000	2.7	2.0	
P50	124,000	121,100	125,400	123,200	0,0	0.0	
P25	111,300	111,000	111,300	111,000	0.0	0,0	
P10	90,200	92,200	90,200	92,200	0,0	0,0	
Western Broader Public Sec	ctor (klarket 3) (l	H=35)					
P90	166,200	169,900	188,400	200,000	21.1	26.9	
P75	149,300	147,300	164,800	167;300	11,9	9.1	
AVE	137,800	136,500	149,200	148,900	8.1	8.9	
P50	134,800	131,400	144,500	138,700	4.8	4.3	
P25	125,300	122,200	126,100	125,900	0.0	0.0	
P10	117,100	. 113,700	117,700	116,400	0.0	0.0	
Western Public Sector (Mar	ket 4) (N=21)						
P90 ·	138,700	142,500	151,300	149,600	10.1	8,5	
P 7 5	133,800	131,100	141,300	138,700	7.4		
AVE	126,700	126,300	131,200	129,600	3,6	2.6	
P50	126,100	125,500	127,500	127,000	0,0	0.0	
P25	120,200	119,500	120,800	121,300	0.0	0.0	
P10	115,400	113,500	116,000	113,500	0,0	0.0	
Variances vs Market P75 (us	sing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	e) ·				
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-4%		1%	6%	·		
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-3%	2%	1%	6%			
Variances us Market P50 (us	sing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	:e)				
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-3%	3%	1%	. 7%			
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-4%	2%	-1%	6%			

^{*}Market Data as of September 2004

Appendix 3

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Deputy Chief Police Survey Points: 1192

Survey Points: 1192	Base Salary		Total Cash		Bonus Payments	
	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Design %	Actual %
D. Webster	114,800	114,800	126,300	126,300	10.0	10.0
National Broader Public Sector	r (Market 1) (N=10					
·P90	152,500	152,500	167,600	165,300	20.8	19.5
P75	133,200	133,000	146,800	144,300	10.6	8.2
AVE	122,300	121,900	130,400	129,200	6.6	6.0
P50	121,400	119,900	127,300	123,900	• 0.0	0.0
P25	108,900	106,400	111,300	110,000	0.0	0.0
P10	91,700	94,300	91,700	95,000 -	0.0	0.0
National Public Sector (Market	2) (N=50)				•	
P90	133,400	. 137,400	141,600	141,100	7.1	- 5.6
P75	127,400	125,600	128,800	127,200	0.6	0.0
AVE	113,300	113,800	115,300	115,200	1.8	1.3
P50	113,200	113,000	115,500	115,100	0.0	0.0
P25	100,900	101,700	100,900	101,700	0.0	0.0
P10	85,800	87,100	85,800	87,100	0.0	0.0
Western Broader Public Secto	or (Market 3) (N=39	9)				
P90	143,500	149,200	158,000	164,700	15.8	22.7
P75 .	133,300	130,600	145,300	142,500	10.0	7.0
AVE	123,700	121,700	131,100	129,400	6 .0	6.3
P50	123,400	118,600	127,600	123,500	4.0	1.0
P25	112,100	110,000	114,800	113,800	0.0	0.0
P10	. 100,600	99,200	102,000	102,200	0.0	0.0
Western Public Sector (Marke	t 4) (N=23)		•			
P90	131,600	128,400	140,000	132,100	7.1	8.
P75	126,200	121,400	127,300	124,200	6.2	4.
AVE	116,700	115,400	119,400	117,300	2.3	1.
P50	115,700	115,400	119,000	117,700	0.0	0.
P25	108,800	107,900	109,800	109,700	0.0	, O.
P10 .	98,400	97,600	98,500	97,600	0.0	0.
Variances vs Market P75 (usi	ng City of Winnip	eg as the base)				
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-11%	+1%	-2%	+9%		
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-10%	-1%	-1 %	+7%		
Variances vs Market P50 (usi	ng City of Winnip	eg as the base)				
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-6%	-4%	-1%	+2%		
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-7%	-4%	-1%	·+2%		

^{*} Market Data as of September 2004

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Deputy Chief Police Survey Points: 1192

Survey Points: 1192						
	Base Salary Design Actual		Total Cash Design Actual		Bonus Payments Design % Actual %	
Hanna Tasharias						
Menno Zacharias	114,800	117,900	126,300	129,700	10.0	10.0
National Broader Public Sector	(Market 1) (N=10	2)			,	
P90	162,500	152,500	167,600	165,300	20.8	19.5
P75	133,200	133,000	146,800	144,300	10.6	8.2
AVE	122,300	121,900	130,400	129,200	6.6	. 6.0
P50	121,400	119,900	127,300	123,900	1 0.0	0.0
P25	108,900	106,400 .	111,300	110,000	0.0	0.0
P10 ·	91,700	94,300	91,700	95,000 ,	0.0	0.0
National Public Sector (Market	2) (N=50)					
P90	133,400	137,400	141,600	141,100	7.1	5.6
P75	127,400	125,600	128,800	127,200	0.6	0.0
AVE .	113,300	113,800	115,300	115,200	1.8	1.3
P50	113,200	113,000	115,500	115,100	0.0	0.0
P25	100,900	101,700	100,900	101,700	0.0	0.0
P10	85,800	87,100	85,800	87,100	0.0	0.0
Western Broader Public Secto	r (Market 3) (N=3	9)				
P90	143,500	149,200	158,000	164,700	15.8	22.7
P75	133,300	130,600	145,300	142,500	10,0	7.0
AVE	123,700	121,700	131,100	129,400	6.0	6.3
· P50	123,400	118,600	127,600	123,500	4.0	1.6
P25	112,100	110,000	114,800	113,800	0.0	0.0
P10 ·	100,600	99,200	102,000	102,200	. 0.0	0.0
Western Public Sector (Market	t 4) (N =2 3)					
P90	131,600	128,400	140,000	132,100	7.1	6.2
P75	126,200	121,400	127,300	124,200	6.2	4.0
AVE	116,700	115,400	119,400	117,300	2.3	1.
P50	115,700	115,400	119,000	117,700	0.0	0.
P25	108,800	107,900	109,800	109,700	0.0	0.
P10	98,400	97,600	98,500	97,600	0.0	٠ 0.
Variances vs Market P75 (usir	ng City of Winnipe	og as the base)				
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-11%	+4%	-2%	+11%		
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-10%	+2%	-1%	+9%		
Variances vs Market P50 (usin	ng City of Winnip	eg as the base)				•
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	-6%	-1%	-1%	+4%		
vs. Western BPS (Market 3)	-7%	0%	-1%.	+5%	-	

^{*} Market Dala as of September 2004

City of Winnipeg

Job Title: Deputy Chief Fire/Paramedics Survey Points: 1040

Survey Points: 1040	Base Salary		Total Cash		Bonus Payments	
	Design	Actual	Design	Actual	Design %	Actual %
ames Brennan	114,800	107,000	126,300	117,700	10.0	10.0
lational Broader Public Sect	or (Harket 1) (N	=109)		•		
P90	137,300	137,300	151,200	151,300	20.0	18,6
P76	123,900	124,100	133,400	131,800	10.0	8.3
AVE	112,700	112,500	119,900	. 118,900	▼ 6.4	5.7
P50	112,500	110,600	117,300	115,300	0.0	0,0
P25	99,700	98,700	102,700	102,400	0.0	0.0
P10	87,400	88,200	\$7,400	88,700	0.0	0.0
lational Public Sector (Mark	et 2) (N=52)	•		•		
P90	127,500	129,000	131,800	130,000	7.0	4.7
P75	118,400	117,600	121,300	118,800	0,0	0,0
A√E	105,900	106,000	107,500	107,000	1.5	1.0
P60	105,500	104,300	106,500	105,200	0.0	0.0
P25	93,000	93,400	93,400	94,400	0,0	0.0
P10	81,700	\$2,900	81,700	82,900	0.0	0,0
Vestern Broader Public Sect	tor (Harket 3) (H	(c42)				
P90	129,300	133,600	143,700	146,700	15.2	20.6
P76	121,300	120,300	131,400	129,400	10.0	8,9
∧∨E	113,200	111,500	119,900	118,200	5.9	5 .0
P50	113,900	108,500	117,600	115,000	4.0	2.7
P25	103,100	100,500	106,000	104,300	0.0	0.0
P10	94,200	92,400	95,100	95,200	0.0	0,
Western Public Sector (Mark	et 4) (N=24)					
P90	123,900	124,500	134,500	128,500	7.0	5.
P75	117,100	114,700	120,700	116,200	6,0	. 3
AVE	109,100	10\$,100	111,400	109,800	2.2	1.
P50	107,200	106,600	112,000	108,000	0.0	0
P25	99,500	98,600	99,900	99,900	0.0	·o
P10	89,400	88,700	89,400	90,300	. 0,0	0
Variances vs Market P75 (us	ing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	e)			
vs. National PS (Market 2)	-3%	-10%	4%	-1%		
vs. Western PS (Market 4)	-2%	-7%	4%	1%		
Variances vs Market P50 (us	ing City of Win	nipeg as the bas	:e)		•	
vs. National BPS (Market 1)	2%	-3%	7%	2%		ī
vs. Western BP8 (Market 3)	1%	-1%	7%.	. 236		

^{*}Market Data as of September 2004